#### IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA

#### **CHARLESTON DIVISION**

IN RE: AMERICAN MEDICAL SYSTEMS, INC.
PELVIC REPAIR SYSTEMS
PRODUCT LIABILITY LITIGATION

**MDL No. 2325** 

-----

#### THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO ALL CASES

#### PRETRIAL ORDER #118

(AGREED ORDER AND STIPULATION REGARDING PROTOCOL FOR COLLECTION, PRESERVATION, AND DIVISION OF PATHOLOGY MATERIAL)

Counsel for Plaintiffs and Counsel for Defendant American Medical Systems ("AMS") have met and conferred regarding the collection, preservation, and division of pathology material. Following that meet and confer, the parties have stipulated to and petitioned the court to enter the following Stipulation in this matter, attached as **Exhibit A**. Upon entry of this Order, the court approves the protocols and same will apply to all actions that are or become a part of MDL 2325, until further order of the court. **IT IS SO ORDERED**.

The court DIRECTS the Clerk to file a copy of this order in 2-12-md-2325 and it shall apply to each member AMS-related case previously transferred to, removed to, or filed in this district, which includes counsel in all member cases up to and including civil action number 2:14-cv-10627. In cases subsequently filed in this district, a copy of the most recent pretrial order will be provided by the Clerk to counsel appearing in each

1

new action at the time of filing of the complaint. In cases subsequently removed or transferred to this court, a copy of the most recent pretrial order will be provided by the Clerk to counsel appearing in each new action upon removal or transfer. It shall be the responsibility of the parties to review and abide by all pretrial orders previously entered by the court. The orders may be accessed through the CM/ECF system or the court's website at www.wvsd.uscourts.gov.

**ENTERED:** February 19, 2014

Cheryl A. Eifert

United States Magistrate Judge

#### **EXHIBIT A**

# STIPULATION REGARDING COLLECTION, DIVISION AND PRESERVATION OF PATHOLOGY MATERIAL

This stipulation is entered between Plaintiffs and Defendant American Medical Systems, Inc. ("AMS") (collectively, the "Parties"), by and through their respective counsel, to provide a protocol for the collection, preservation, and division of all gross and microscopic material purported to contain mesh or any other of Plaintiffs' pelvic floor tissue excised or explanted from Plaintiffs, including but not limited to slides, special stains, blocks, and gross material (the "Material").

It is the intention of the Parties that all Material be preserved in a manner that permits the Parties equal access to and analysis of the Material. The Parties will not interfere with or circumvent the analysis and preservation of pathology by the Facilities to which any of Plaintiffs' treating physicians have sent or will send the Material in the usual course of business.

#### **Notice of Explant**

- 1. Within 24 hours of receipt of information that a plaintiff has scheduled a mesh revision, excision, or explant surgery, or as soon as practicable thereafter, Plaintiffs' counsel shall notify counsel for AMS of the date and location of such surgery.
  - 2. Such notice shall be provided by email to: AMSService@reedsmith.com.

#### Joint Request for Collection, Preservation, and Division of the Material

- 1. Concurrently with provision of the above-referenced notice, counsel for Plaintiffs shall send a letter to the Facility where the revision, excision, or explant surgery is to occur in the form attached as <u>Attachment A</u>. It is the intention of the parties that this letter shall advise the Facility of the need to collect, preserve, and divide the Material as critical evidence in the Litigation, and that each of the Parties will separately provide specific instructions for preservation and shipment of its respective half of the Material.
- 2. After a letter in the form set forth in Attachment A has been sent to the Facility, it shall be incumbent on each Party to provide the Facility with instructions for the preservation and shipment of its half of the Material, and to arrange for payment of any costs associated with the requested preservation and shipment. In no event shall Plaintiffs be responsible for the manner, method, or timing of the preservation of the Material for AMS. Plaintiff assumes no additional responsibilities for the preservation of the AMS Material beyond providing instruction as set forth in Attachment A.
- 3. When requesting Material from a Facility for any purpose, Plaintiffs shall use the instructions contained in Attachment A.
- 4. Plaintiffs shall provide to the Facility a HIPAA-compliant authorization and any other form requiring Plaintiff's signature for the collection and division of the Material.

#### **Indivisible and Small Samples**

- 1. If in the course of dividing the Material to preserve at least one-half for use by the other Party it becomes impossible to provide two equal (or nearly equal) halves of the Material, the Parties agree to meet and confer and attempt to arrive at a mutually agreeable protocol as to the Material. Neither Party will perform any review, analysis, or testing on the Material or alter the Material in any way prior to reaching a mutually agreeable protocol. In the event that no agreement can be reached, the Parties will seek the Court's guidance.
- 2. In the event that any of the Material is less than 120 mg. in mass of a foreign body and surrounding tissue (herein after "Small Sample"), this shall be considered too small to be divided equally among the Parties. In the event of a Small Sample, the parties agree to meet and confer and attempt to arrive at a mutually agreeable protocol to allow for equal examination of the Small Sample. Neither party shall perform any review, analysis, or testing on the Small Sample or alter the Small Sample in any way prior to reaching a mutually agreeable protocol. In the event no agreement can be reached, the parties will seek the Court's guidance.

#### Misc.

- 1. The Parties shall request that the Facilities execute an original chain of custody in the form attached at Attachment B for any Material any party removes from any Facility. Subsequently, the chain of custody will be completed by each individual or entity having custody of the Material from the time it leaves the possession of the Facilities.
- 2. All costs associated with the division of the Material under this protocol shall be shared equally by the Parties. All costs associated with the preservation of the Material after its division under this protocol shall be borne by the Party requesting such preservation. And all costs associated with the evaluation of the Material under this protocol shall be borne by the Party performing the evaluation.
- 3. Nothing in this Stipulation shall be construed to preclude a Party from challenging the method of preservation of the Material and/or from moving for spoliation sanctions.

#### APPROVED:

/s/Amy Eskin	/s/Barbara Binis
/s/Fidelma Fitzpatrick	/s/Tracy Weiss
ATTORNEYS FOR PLAINTIFFS	ATTORNEYS FOR AMERICAN MEDICAL SYSTEMS, INC.

#### **ATTACHMENT A**

#### **VERY IMPORTANT – REQUEST FOR PRESERVATION OF PATHOLOGY**

[Date]

Attn: Departments of Surgery and Pathology

[Address of Explant Facility]

Re: [Date of Anticipated Explant Surgery, Case Caption]

Dear Departments of Surgery and Pathology:

I represent the Plaintiff, Ms. [Plaintiff's last name], and Heather Ritch cc'ed below represents the Defendant, American Medical Systems (AMS), in the above-captioned lawsuit. There is no litigation pending against your facility or the treating physician in this matter. I write to request the preservation of pathology material from Ms. [Plaintiff's last name]'s surgery, scheduled for [Date] to be performed by Dr. [Explant Surgeon].

It is important to both parties to this lawsuit that any pathology obtained during this upcoming surgery be preserved for future analysis by their respective experts. The parties request that you preserve, photograph, and divide the specimen(s) obtained as follows:

#### **Instructions for Immediate Preservation of the Specimen(s):**

The parties request immediate preservation of the specimen(s) and will separately provide further instructions for preservation of the specimen(s) immediately upon explant.

#### **Instructions for Division into Equal Specimen(s):**

The parties request division of each specimen or specimens in equal or nearly equal portions for their respective analysis as follows:

The specimen(s) should be divided such that the amount of foreign material, if any, is approximately equal in the two samples. The division of the specimen(s) into two equal (or nearly equal) portions for analysis by the Parties shall be as follows:

- (a) cut the specimen(s) (or each piece of the specimen) through the longest axis of the mesh part into two pieces (may or may not be the longest axis of entire tissue);
- (b) if there is mucosa, the cut needs to be through the point where the mesh is closest to the surface or mucosal defect/ulceration if present;
- (c) if there is a nodule, the cut should be through the middle of the nodule; and
- (d) any foreign material and surrounding tissue in the specimen(s) should not be separated prior to dividing the specimen(s) in half.

If in the course of dividing the specimen(s), it becomes impossible to provide two equal (or nearly equal) halves of the specimen(s), please immediately notify the representatives

of the parties listed below. The parties will confer re: access to the specimen(s) and provide further instructions re: same.

#### **Instructions for Photographing Specimen(s) Before and After Division:**

Additionally, the parties request photographs depicting the specimen(s) before and after division as follows:

Please document the method of division and photograph the specimen(s) prior to and after its division, as follows:

- (a) depicting entire specimen (or specimens, if excised in more than one part) prior to splitting, fresh, without fixative, with scale and identifiers; and
- (b) depicting entire specimen (or specimens, if excised in more than one part) after splitting, fresh, without fixative, with scale and identifiers.

In order to facilitate this request, enclosed please find a HIPAA-compliant authorization for the release of the specimen(s) to be removed during this surgery, signed by Ms. [Plaintiff's last name]. Also enclosed is a chain of custody form; the Parties request that this form accompany the specimen(s) when it leaves your facility.

Each party will follow-up separately with further instructions on the mode of preservation and shipping of its half of the specimen(s), and to arrange for reimbursement for any costs incurred by you for preservation, division, and shipping. Should you have any questions or concerns regarding this matter, please contact us by email directed to representatives of both parties: Michaela McInnis at mmcinnis@motleyrice.com (counsel for Plaintiff) and Heather Ritch at hritch@reedsmith.com\_(counsel for Defendant).

If you are not the appropriate recipient of this request, please forward a copy of this letter to the appropriate person or entity responsible for ensuring compliance with the terms of this preservation request. Thank you very much for your assistance.

Very truly yours,

/s/ Fidelma Fitzpatrick
Fidelma Fitzpatrick
Counsel for Plaintiff

#### **ENCLOSURE**

cc: Heather A. Ritch, Esq. (Counsel for Defendant, American Medical Systems)

#### CHAIN OF CUSTODY FORM FOR PATHOLOGY MATERIALS

[Plaintiff(s) v. American Medical Systems, Inc.]

# ENTRY NO. 1 Received by (Name, Company/Organization, Address, and Telephone Number): Date: Time: Signature of Recipient\_\_\_\_\_ Item Description (include manner of preservation, size of specimen, slide numbers and any other identifying marks): (1) Note any change of condition: Name of Releasing Party Date: Time: Signature of Releasing Party \_\_\_\_\_

## CHAIN OF CUSTODY FORM FOR PATHOLOGY MATERIALS

[Plaintiff(s) v. American Medical Systems, Inc.]

ENTRY NO. 2
Received by (Name, Company/Organization, Address, and Telephone Number):
Date:
Γime:
Signature of Recipient
tem Description (include manner of preservation, size of specimen, slide numbers and any other
dentifying marks):
1)
2)
3)
Note any change of condition:
Name of Releasing Party
value of Refeasing Larry
Date:
Γime:
Signature of Releasing Party

## CHAIN OF CUSTODY FORM FOR PATHOLOGY MATERIALS

[Plaintiff(s) v. American Medical Systems, Inc.]

ENTRY NO. 3	
Received by (Name, Company/Organization, Address, and Telep	hone Number):
Date:	
Time:	
Signature of Recipient	
	12.1 1 1 1
Item Description (include manner of preservation, size of specime	en, slide numbers and any other
identifying marks):	
<u>(1)</u>	
(2)	
<u>(3)</u>	
Note any abance of conditions	
Note any change of condition:	
Name of Releasing Party	
Traine of Releasing Farty	
Date:	
Time:	
Signature of Releasing Party	